



Planning and Zoning Commission Meeting - Regular MINUTES

Tuesday, May 11, 2021 at 4:30 PM
Ketchum City Hall
480 East Avenue North, Ketchum, ID 83340

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 4:30 PM by Chair Neil Morrow.

PRESENT

Chairman Neil Morrow
Vice-Chairman Mattie Mead
Commissioner Tim Carter
Commissioner Jennifer Cosgrove
Commissioner Brenda Moczygemba

COMMISSION REPORTS AND EX PARTE DISCUSSION DISCLOSURE

Vice-Chair Mead noted he has made a point of not speaking to acquaintances about this project. Commissioner Moczygemba disclosed she worked for Michael Doty about 2 years ago.

CONSENT CALENDAR—ACTION ITEMS

1. Minutes of April 27, 2021

Motion to approve the Minutes of April 27, 2021.

Motion made by Commissioner Moczygemba, Seconded by Commissioner Cosgrove.

Voting Yea: Chairman Morrow, Vice-Chairman Mead, Commissioner Carter, Commissioner Cosgrove, Commissioner Moczygemba

COMMUNICATIONS FROM STAFF – ACTION ITEMS

2. Bluebird Village Community Housing Project, P 21-027 Pre-Design Review

The project is proposed at 480 East Avenue. The project consists of two buildings providing 56 units of community housing within 60,038 square feet. A total of 49 parking space are proposed for the project.

The Planning and Zoning Commission will take public comment and discuss with the applicant the proposed design.

Director Frick introduced the project. Public Comment received up until noon today was sent to the Commissioners and posted to the Ketchum website.

Applicant Greg Dunfield presented an overview of the history of the funding for this project and the location for the Bluebird Village. Changes were made to the design after Community input was received. The amenities preferred by tenants were full size washer/dryers, storage areas with shelving, bike storage and chargers, and decks. Income levels and rents were discussed. The combination of tax credits, land-lease and long-term ownership were presented.

Michael Doty, Architect for Bluebird, presented the aspects of the location. He compared heights of surrounding buildings, slope of the site, landscaping, fourth floor setbacks, ground floor retail, floor plans, exterior materials and elevations, and stairs.

Chair Morrow opened the floor to Public Comment.

Sarah Michael, spoke in support of the project, citing the FAR, the mix of exterior materials, and the location.

Dr Nancy Perry, neighbor and retired doctor, spoke to her office as being named a Heritage structure. She wanted to keep Ketchum the way it is.

Susan Passovoy, resident, thought we needed the project, but it should meet all aspects of the Code including the design. She asked for a materials board for the Public and a scale model. She suggested 3-D cad drawings be put online for public viewing. She asked for reduced mass.

Gary Hoffman spoke against the negative public reactions. He spoke to the criticism of his affordable housing. He supported the project.

Liz Keegan, resident, noted the exterior materials and design and thought parking was a non-issue. She supported the project.

Chris Gilarowski, resident of Northwood, supported the housing and the design. He liked the solar and the bike chargers.

Sue Dumke, adjacent neighbor, objected to the lack of setbacks, noise, safety of her building, and the preservation of a heritage tree.

Gwen Raney, spoke to the exterior materials (brick) as not being traditional.

Susan Scovell, resident and former PZ Commissioner, spoke to the desirability of the materials. She liked the windows and light. She supported the design.

Bruce Johnson, resident and economist, objected to a City housing project. He supported housing vouchers instead.

Russ Train, resident, thought all incomes should be able to rent at Bluebird. He noted restaurants are closing for lack of help and people are losing their housing. He supported the design of the project.

Reid Stillman noted there are many homeless residents due to a lack of housing. He asked how the City will provide housing now. He supported the project.

Meredith Richardson, resident, spoke in support of the project. She liked the architecture and parking. She noted the number of people needing housing and supported the project.

Nancie Tatum, resident, wanted realistic housing solutions. She expressed concerns over the lack of setbacks and the facade design. She recommended limiting it to a 3-story building. She thought the gym was unnecessary.

Spencer Cordavano , resident, supported the project. Liked the design and suggested all parking on the first floor. Asked if pets would be allowed. He liked the storage.

Stephanie Zable, resident, objected to the design of the building without setbacks and the possibility of too many pets. Thought there would be noise from the animals, animal waste, and possible dog attacks on pedestrians. She questioned icicles forming on the building as being a public safety issue.

Perry Boyle, resident, was currently working on a low-rent project for Ketchum. He thought this project was too big for the site and should be in another zone.

Susan Martin, owns a home at Walnut and 5th, was concerned with a large building complex in the downtown. She thought it incompatible and out of character.

Celia Renga, 3rd generation Ketchum-ite, thought it was the people that give Ketchum character and not buildings. She lost her apartment at the Ketch Building and supported the project. The working professionals in Ketchum need housing.

Linda Badell, resident, objected to dumping all housing in one location. She didn't want to see housing in the City Core.

Rick Osborne, resident, thought it was too big and in the wrong location.

David Herd, supported the housing but was against Bluebird. He thought City Offices should stay where they are and the project would change the character of the town. He objected to the tandem parking.

Rebecca Bundy, planner, supported the project, liked the facade, and the amenities. She liked the architecture and thought it fit in this eclectic town and it was the perfect location. Downtown is where height is allowed, and setbacks are not required.

Sally Onetto, resident, all support affordable housing. Safety issues include some units do not have access to the elevator. Elevator must be larger. She objected to no air conditioning and thought icicles may be a problem.

Annie Cantrell, teacher, related that housing is the main topic on media message boards. She emphasized the importance of the people to the Community who would be the renters of these apartments. Noted the people with comfy homes are objecting to the project. She feared the loss of community and was in support of the project.

Tim Eagan, former Chair of BCHA and KURA member, stated those agencies tried for 10 years to create Affordable Housing but a lack of political will produced no results. He noted that you can never please everyone and that the need for affordable housing in the Community is overwhelming. No housing was built in the past due to political pressures and now is the time to "take the shots".

Beverly Dechevrieux, property owner, opposed the project and disliked the blue panels. She objected to the possibilities the balconies would be used for personal storage. Wanted to know about maintenance of the building.

Aaron Dechevrieux, noted his adjacent renters would be affected by the project. We need housing but not here.

Paddy McIlvoy, co-owner of Backwoods Mountain Sports, in favor of the project. He noted we need this project and 10 more like it. This is about people and not buildings. If services are not available, you will not want to live here.

John Melin, owner Ketchum Kitchens, objected to lack of parking as it affects businesses. He thought the parking study was inaccurate.

Rachelle DeLong, 580 5th St, was in support of work force housing but not at this location. Thought it was not the appropriate place. Felt parking would affect them, with the lack of setbacks and objected to the removal of trees. She objected to the building blocking the view and sunlight. She objected to balconies facing their property. She objected to the mass of the building.

Being no further comment, Public Comment was closed.

Vice-Chair Mead asked the applicant for more information on safety measures. He asked for information on how this was different from the Ketch Buildings. Michael Doty addressed the elevator comments and said it could be enlarged. He noted there were 2 ways of egress on each floor. The flat roof does not support icicles and the decks are drip through.

Commissioner Moczygemba asked about windows for bedrooms. Doty noted they are for exiting, light and fresh air. Exterior windows are not required for egress. They discussed the Building Code requirements and structural requirements.

There was a discussion of Community Housing and the Ketch Building. The Title Report specifies that this is a totally Affordable Housing building for 40 years. Should the use change, the City can take the property back. KCDC owns the property.

Commissioner Cosgrove asked about the outreach at Northwood Place. Dunfield spoke to the feedback from the Northwood residents on what works and what doesn't. The granting of the tax credit made the project feasible. The public was asked to vote on 3 designs before the package was brought to the PZ.

Commissioner Cosgrove thought there was a disconnect between the various materials. Doty noted the materials were muted earth tones, low maintenance, and inter-related as defined by the uses and varied textures. The brick is historic but on a different scale. The wood is on the shady side and the metal is used quite frequently around town. The blue is an accent at the end of the corridors. There was a discussion of exterior materials and undulation.

Commissioner Moczygemba did not like the materials on 5th Street. There was a discussion of alternatives.

Commissioner Carter asked about the 4th Floor and the setbacks.

There was an attempt to maximize the number of units on the property. There was a discussion of the Text Amendment being developed that concerns setbacks and a fourth floor.

Chair Morrow commented on the location of the power box and the height of the building in comparison to the existing trees. He noted that the essential personnel of Ketchum would qualify for this housing and the subject of a Ketchum preference policy. He asked about a materials board for public viewing. Dunfield noted that pets would be permitted with a deposit, that the alley configuration would be to code for emergency services, assigned parking spaces would be allotted per unit.

Vice-Chair Mead liked the differentiation and thought it was a great design. He wanted to preserve the number of units. He liked the refined design.

There was a discussion of the South wall and how to soften it. They discussed how this building might co-ordinate with the Historic structures in town and the transition into smaller buildings. They discussed the mass of the building and the number of dwelling units. They determined the need for the Parking/Traffic Study to be explained to the Public and compared to the current parking area downtown.

Motion to approve Pre-Design Review for the Bluebird Village Community Housing Project and proceed to full Design Review.

Motion made by Vice-Chairman Mead, Seconded by Commissioner Carter.

Voting Yea: Chairman Morrow, Vice-Chairman Mead, Commissioner Carter, Commissioner Cosgrove, Commissioner Moczygemba

STAFF REPORTS & CITY COUNCIL MEETING UPDATE

At the City Council Meeting on May 17th:

Westcliff Town Homes Preliminary Plat and Phasing Agreement

At the Planning and Zoning Commission Meeting on May 25th:

Reinheimer Ranch Field Daze Conditional Use Permit

Pioneer Pickleball Club Conditional Use Permit in the LI.

Chair Morrow asked for a check on affordable units being sublet.

ADJOURNMENT

Motion to adjourn at 8:30 PM.

Motion made by Chairman Morrow, Seconded by Commissioner Cosgrove.

Voting Yea: Chairman Morrow, Vice-Chairman Mead, Commissioner Carter, Commissioner Cosgrove, Commissioner Moczygemba



Neil Morrow - Chairman